Arizona Smart Scorecard
A tool for community self-assessment
The Arizona Smart Growth Scorecard is a valuable tool for community self-assessment developed by a working group of the Growth Cabinet with input from public and private stakeholders. It is designed to strengthen the ability of local officials to plan for future growth and development and to adopt comprehensive strategies that address growth related pressures. As Arizona continues to attract unprecedented population growth, all levels of government must play a role in wisely planning and managing both the challenges and opportunities that new growth and development present.

**What Is Smart Growth?**

Growth itself is neither positive nor negative, but the cumulative effects of population growth, its patterns and form have long-term social, environmental, and economic consequences. Smart growth is guiding growth in ways that result in vibrant communities, strong economies, and a healthy environment. Smart growth means adding new homes, schools, businesses, jobs and infrastructure to Arizona in a way that makes sense and promotes balance. Smart growth enhances the communities where we live, but does not over-burden our transportation and infrastructure systems, pollute our air and waters, or deplete our open spaces and magnificent natural landscapes. Smart growth embodies qualities that make communities great places to live and gives them a sense of place – recreational amenities, historic spaces, vibrant downtowns, choices in transportation and housing, prudent investments in capital facilities and infrastructure, and opportunities for diversity and citizen involvement.

**Characteristics of Smart Growth**

The Smart Growth Network states that “the features that distinguish smart growth in a community vary from place to place. In general, smart growth invests time, attention, and resources in restoring community vitality to center cities and older suburbs. New smart growth is more town-centered, is transit and pedestrian oriented, and has a greater mix of housing, commercial and retail uses. It also preserves open space and many other environmental amenities”.

The American Planning Association (APA) defines smart growth as using comprehensive planning to guide, design, develop, revitalize and build communities for all that:

- have a unique sense of community and place;
- preserve and enhance valuable natural and cultural resources;
- equitably distribute the costs and benefits of development;
- expand the range of transportation, employment and housing choices in a fiscally responsible manner;
- value long-range, regional considerations of sustainability over short term incremental geographically isolated actions; and
- promotes public health and healthy communities.

The Urban Land Institute characterizes smart growth as development that is environmentally sensitive, economically viable, community-oriented, and sustainable.

The National Homebuilders Association is in agreement, stating that smart growth will help meet the demands of the ever increasing population and a prosperous economy while also building a political consensus (a) to support comprehensive local plans employing market-sensitive and innovative land-use planning concepts to achieve a wide range of housing choices for all Americans, (b) to fairly and fully finance infrastructure to support necessary new residential, commercial, and industrial growth, and (c) to preserve meaningful open space and protect the environment.
**Why a Scorecard?**
Recognizing that communities measure and track how well they are implementing smart growth and look for areas of improvement, the Growth Cabinet prepared this Scorecard to help communities assess whether they have the right tools in place to promote smart growth. Executive Order 2007-05, directed state agencies to identify how state discretionary funds might provide incentives to communities for growing smarter and technical assistance for those needing support. The intent is to provide communities, counties, and Tribal governments - small or large, rural or urban - with a simple, clear, usable means of evaluating how well prepared they are for the pressures of growth. In addition, the Scorecard can help spur action on local and regional approaches to address growth issues and provide incentives and assistance to communities wanting to effectively and efficiently manage development.

Cities, towns, counties, and Tribal governments will be evaluated by the set of smart growth criteria and indicators contained within the Scorecard.

**What Framework Was Used to Develop The Scorecard?**
The Growing Smarter Guiding Principles, Arizona’s planning statutes, and the implementation of smart growth techniques and tools (such as mixed use zoning, pedestrian oriented design, focusing growth in areas around transportation, and regional planning) provide the foundation for Arizona’s Smart Growth Scorecard.

Arizona’s Growing Smarter Guiding Principles were developed by the Growing Smarter Oversight Council through an extensive statewide process and provide a vision for managing Arizona’s rapid growth and long term planning for the next 100 years. The Guiding Principles are organized into six major categories which provide the basis for the Scorecard:

- Responsibility and Accountability
- Preservation of Community Character
- Stewardship of Natural Resources
- Opportunity for Broad Choices
- Essential Service Infrastructure
- Economic Development

The Growing Smarter planning statutes provide cities, towns, and counties with a number of planning and zoning guidelines, and require the consideration of a variety of planning elements in the general plans of municipalities and comprehensive plans of counties. The Scorecard builds on this existing framework of smart growth planning for small, medium and large communities and counties by evaluating whether or not local planning goals are being accomplished in connection with effective implementation strategies and solid results.

**How Does The Scorecard Work?**
The Scorecard is an incentive-based tool to help cities, towns and counties evaluate their growth planning efforts. All entities applying for grants and loans from state discretionary funding must reference a Scorecard. This approach encourages citizens, non-profit organizations, and other entities to talk with their community leaders, make sure a Scorecard is filled out, and ultimately encourage them to implement smart growth practices.

Existing agency grant program guidelines and standards remain the same; however, the score determines whether financial incentives or technical assistance will be provided by the granting program. The Scorecard is designed to provide incentive-based advantages to communities engaged in smart growth planning and implementation and help build the capacity of those communities that need assistance.

**Communities - cities, towns, and counties**
A completed Scorecard is a requirement for communities that apply for grants and loans from state discretionary funding.

**Citizens, non-profit organizations, special districts, and other community groups**
When citizens, non-profit organizations, special districts, and other community groups apply for state discretionary loans or grants, they will reference the Smart Growth Scorecard of the community closest to their proposed project. If a project spans more than one jurisdiction, the applicant can choose the best score for their application. Incentives will apply depending on the community’s score. The granting agency will provide direction within their application information on how this will work.
**Tribal governments and Tribal political subdivisions**

Tribes and Tribal subdivisions must complete and submit their own Scorecard, use a scorecard of the county they are located within, or use a nearby community’s scorecard.

**Financial Incentives**

For smart growth communities (i.e. a community that has a high score - see Tallying the Results below), a variety of incentives will be available depending on the individual funding agency and program. Some examples include additional funding, basis points off loans and lower interest rates.

**Technical and Financial Assistance**

For communities that are transitioning toward smarter growth and development (i.e. a community that has a score that could use improvement), the agency will offer technical and/or financial assistance.

Note that a low score may also give an entity priority for certain grants, such as technical assistance grants.

**How should the scorecard be completed?**

With assistance from staff, community stakeholders, and other individuals or groups as necessary, the Growth Cabinet recommends that the chief executive officer of the municipality, county, or Tribal Government (including Tribal political subdivision) (e.g. City Manager, County Administrator, or Tribal Leader), or his/her designee, answer the Scorecard questions. A narrative response to each question describing or citing the specific policies, regulations, or activities that support the given answer should be included in the comments field after each question. Supplemental materials may be submitted at a jurisdiction’s discretion.

An online, interactive Scorecard has been created, so all questions and supporting documentation can be submitted electronically. It is preferable that the Scorecard be submitted online, however, it may also be printed and submitted via fax or regular mail to the Office of Smart Growth. For those communities seeking assistance in completing the Scorecard, the Arizona Department of Commerce Office of Smart Growth will provide assistance in the form of materials and workshops. The results will be posted online and used by agencies in all programs, where applicable, to make decisions on grants or loans using agency funds.

**How are the scores determined?**

The Scorecard is comprised of the six Growing Smarter Guiding Principles criteria along with a list of associated smart growth and planning indicators. The overall calculation of these criteria and indicators is used to obtain a “score” for your community or jurisdiction.

Smart growth criteria and indicators are applied differently to each of the three size categories of community and county populations as devised in the Growing Smarter statutes (A.R.S. §9-461.05 and §11-821). The larger the jurisdiction, the more criteria will apply. This separate application of criteria acknowledges that planning techniques and funding to support smart growth may differ by the growth pressures facing your community and that the level of technical and financial resources available to small, mid-size or large towns, cities, counties, and Tribal governments may be significantly different in a state as diverse as Arizona. The Scorecard will indicate where each criterion applies to different sized communities.

Small and medium communities are encouraged but **not required** to complete the entire Scorecard to assess their strengths and challenges for managing future growth. State discretionary loan and grant process will only consider scores appropriate to community size in determining incentives and assistance.
INTRODUCTION

TALLYING THE RESULTS
1. Total each individual section (section subtotals)
2. Add up the subtotals for the overall score
3. Compare the total overall score to the three scoring categories shown below.

The online Scorecard submittal process will calculate scores automatically.

Small Communities: 24 questions
58 – 72 pts (80% - 100%) = smart growth
43 – 57 pts (60% - 79%) = in transition
42 pts and below (0% - 59%) = needs attention

Medium Communities: 42 questions
100 – 126 pts (80% - 100%) = smart growth
76 – 100 pts (60% - 79%) = in transition
75 pts and below (0% - 59%) = needs attention

Large Communities: 50 questions
120 – 150 pts (80% - 100%) = smart growth
90 – 119 pts (60% - 79%) = in transition
89 pts and below (0% - 59%) = needs attention

WHAT YOUR SCORES CAN TELL YOU

In assessing your overall scores, we suggest you consider these basic messages:

Smart Growth: Scores in this category indicate that a community has taken initiative to implement smart growth policies in a positive direction.

In Transition: To move in the smart growth direction, look at your weaker section scores. Study individual results and identify steps that can lead you to achieve a higher score.

Needs Attention: It is important to analyze the results carefully to evaluate specific challenges and areas for improvement. Identify steps that will get you on the path for wiser planning and development. The state offers opportunities that can help increase your planning capacity. Contact state planning assistance programs like the Arizona Department of Commerce Office of Smart Growth or the Center for Housing Affordability and Livable Communities (CHALC) at the Arizona Department of Housing for assistance.

For additional information and questions, please contact:

Office of Smart Growth
Arizona Department of Commerce
1700 West Washington, Suite 420
Phoenix, AZ  85007
phone (602) 771-1191
fax (602) 771-1210
www.azcommerce.com
Public officials should embrace the responsibility for guiding local communities toward beneficial long-term growth and development while seeking broad community benefit, engaging regional partnerships and facilitating compliance with planning and land use regulations. Because many growth issues transcend political boundaries, communities should actively engage in regional cooperation with local, state, federal and Tribal representatives. Planning processes should engage people in issues while facilitating the implementation of a unified community vision.

“Without a sense of caring, there can be no sense of community.”
– Anthony J. D’Angelo

These flow charts, available on the Arizona Department of Commerce website (www.azcommerce.com), indicate the general and comprehensive plan elements required by the Growing Smarter statutes. Refer A.R.S §9-461.05 and §11-821 for specific statutory requirements.

All Communities (small, medium and large)

1. Is your general/comprehensive plan current and inclusive of all Growing Smarter elements as required by state statute?
   • Our plan is current with all required elements and has one or more additional elements not required by statute; it is reviewed annually by staff and amended as necessary. _ 3 points
   • Our plan is current with all required elements and is reviewed annually by staff. _ 2 points
   • We are currently preparing a general/comprehensive plan in conformance with the requirements established by the Growing Smarter statutes. _ 1 point

Comments:
Growing Smarter/Plus Legislation promotes greater citizen and regional participation:

‘Adopt written procedures to provide effective, early and continuous public participation... from all geographic, ethnic and economic areas... including broad dissemination of proposals and alternatives; opportunity for written comments; public hearings after effective notice; consideration of public comments’. A.R.S §9-461.06 and §11-806

A regional visioning exercise, Reality Check, was held in Phoenix in May 2008. This exercise brought together leaders and stakeholders to identify core values, build a consensus for a set of guiding principles, build consensus for a common vision and develop goals and implementation strategies for the future. Additional exercises are being planned in northern and southern Arizona. To learn more about Arizona’s Reality Check, visit www.movingazone.com.

Excerpt from the Growing Smarter Act - The purpose of this act is to more effectively plan for the impacts of population growth by creating a more meaningful and predictable land planning process, to increase citizen involvement in the land planning process, to directly acquire and preserve additional open space areas within this state through necessary reforms to the master planning and open space conservation programs of the state land department, and to establish a growth planning analysis process to consider and address various statewide growth management issues so that the future development of land in this state will occur in a more rational, efficient and environmentally sensitive manner that furthers the best interests of the state’s citizens by promoting the protection of its natural heritage without unduly burdening its competitive economy.

2. How do you engage the local community in planning activities?
   - We have an adopted public participation and neighborhood involvement plan that explicitly outlines methods to involve a broad representation of the community, including non-traditional partners (such as non-profit and faith-based organizations, school districts, etc.) using innovative public involvement techniques that go beyond conventional public hearings (design charettes, town halls, workshops, focus groups, youth programs, electronic communication, surveys, etc).
   - We have an adopted public participation plan for amendments to our general/comprehensive plan; and we have a neighborhood participation plan for rezonings.
   - Citizens are encouraged to take part in our public meetings which are held on a regular basis.

3. Are you using your general/comprehensive plan to determine your funding and planning priorities?
   - We conduct a periodic review of the general/comprehensive plan that includes scheduling program priorities according to our capital improvement plan (CIP) and other plans, codes, and regulations (e.g. zoning, construction, design review, water management, open space, etc.).
   - The general/comprehensive plan identifies implementation actions for adopting regulations or funding of public improvements.
   - We have a general/comprehensive plan, zoning ordinance and capital improvement plan (CIP) but they are not linked.

4. Does your community participate in regional planning by coordinating with Tribal governments and State and Federal land managers, and utilize regional plans and policies to guide local decisions and implementation?
   - We meet regularly with regional entities that are involved in land use decisions and we utilize cooperative mechanisms, such as sharing land use data, joint planning meetings, revenue sharing and intergovernmental agreements, to address regional issues and adjacent land use impacts.
   - We participate in some committees (e.g. Council of Governments, etc.) on regional issues, such as water and transportation.
   - We communicate with other jurisdictions on some regional issues.

Comments:
Plans and investments should preserve each community’s sense of place by promoting its distinct identity, culture and history through a local vision created by its citizens. Careful evaluation of planning and zoning decisions should promote local character through the protection of historic and cultural resources, the promotion of art and cultural programs and the protection of recreation and natural areas of value to the community.

“Progress lies not in enhancing what is, but in advancing toward what will be.”
– Kahlil Gibran

Sense of Place: the characteristics of a location that make it readily recognizable as being unique and different from its surroundings and that provides a feeling of belonging to or being identified with that particular place.
- Definition from City of Scottsdale, AZ General Plan

All Communities (small, medium and large)

5. Has your community developed a vision statement with public participation that is reflected in the general/comprehensive plan?
   • We have a vision statement crafted with public participation that guides our general/comprehensive plan and planning decisions. – 3 points
   • We have a vision statement but it is not incorporated into our general/comprehensive plan. – 2 points
   • We are developing a vision statement. – 1 point

   Comments:

Medium and Large Communities

6. Does your community have design mechanisms, such as design guidelines, form-based codes, special districts, area plans, or overlay zones so that streets, buildings, and public spaces work together to create a sense of place and promote local character?
   • We have more than one of these or similar mechanisms in place overseen by a design review process. – 3 points
   • We have one of these or similar mechanisms but do not have a design review process in place. – 2 points
   • We are in the process of developing design mechanisms. Design standards are encouraged, but not required. – 1 point

   Comments:
Local governments can strengthen historic preservation efforts by earning Certified Local Government (CLG) status from the National Park Service. The CLG Program is a partnership between local, state and national governments focused on promoting historic preservation at the grass roots level. Technical assistance from both the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) and small grants are available from the National Park Service. Visit www.nps.gov or the Arizona State Parks Department at www.azstateparks.com for additional information.

7. How does your community protect historic and cultural resources?
   - a) Our city/town has policies in the general plan to inventory and protect historic and cultural resources; an active historic preservation commission and is a Certified Local Government (as defined by the State Historic Preservation Office); or
   - b) Our county has a comprehensive plan with policies to inventory and protect historic and cultural resources and communicates regularly with unincorporated communities to implement these policies.
   - My city/town or county has policies in the general/comprehensive plan to inventory and protect historic and cultural resources.
   - My city/town or county supports the preservation of historic structures and cultural resources but does not have procedures or specific policies in place to protect them.

   Comments:

8. Where does new development connect to your community?
   - New development is encouraged to locate within designated Growth Areas and corridors, infill and redevelopment areas with planned or existing infrastructure; and includes a variety of uses and community services, such as employment, shopping, housing, public spaces, and multimodal opportunities.
   - New development should not be disconnected from the existing town.
   - Growth Areas/corridors, infill and redevelopment areas have been identified.
   - Development generally occurs in a linear pattern along existing or planned roads.

   Comments:

9. Does your community promote art, cultural, and community events for its citizens (such as festivals, farmer’s markets, youth events, regional fairs, and rodeos)?
   - We encourage community events through expedited permitting and/or a dedicated revenue stream; and financial or in-kind support for local and regional organizations that coordinate such events (such as convention and visitor bureaus, local visitor information centers, tourism councils, regional entities, chambers of commerce, and neighborhood groups).
   - We encourage community events by partnering with local and regional organizations.
   - We have adopted policies to encourage special events.

   Comments:
There is a progression of change associated with the lifecycle of buildings: new construction, renovation, rehabilitation, preservation, adaptive reuse, redevelopment and demolition.

**New construction** occurs on vacant land or on land available following demolition.

**Renovation** occurs in the interior or exterior of a structure as the owner updates its use.

**Rehabilitation** takes place when a structure must have more significant updates (such as modernizing the wiring and plumbing).

**Historic preservation** may be required to protect structures over 50 years of age that contribute to an area’s cultural heritage or sense of place.

**Adaptive reuse** is the conversion of older buildings to new activities that may be different from the original use. This type of reuse often focuses on utilizing an older building for a purpose similar to the original use to minimize the cost of renovation, such as the warehouses converted to lofts or former railroad stations, such as Tucson’s historic railroad depot, transformed into retail centers.

**Redevelopment** may occur to address seriously deteriorated or dilapidated buildings within an area. Local governments and/or private owners adapt older buildings to new uses (adaptive reuse) or construct new buildings within a given area (redevelopment). Redevelopment that occurs with the assistance of a local government is typically accompanied by relocation plans to assist and compensate current tenants and property owners.

### Large Communities

10. Does your community have flexible parking regulations to improve circulation and promote community character?
   - Our development regulations prescribe maximum parking provisions; allow parking reductions for mixed use projects, development near transit facilities, or off-site parking provisions (e.g. on-street parking); allow for shared parking; and/or offer credit for parking provided off-site. _3 points_
   - Our development regulations are flexible and allow for some parking requirements. _2 points_
   - We are developing flexible parking regulations. _1 point_

   **Comments:**

11. Does your community have a sign ordinance that is protective of the community’s architectural and historic character?
   - We have a sign ordinance with design review requirements that promotes community character through context sensitive design; parameters for size, color, lighting, and digital capabilities; or similar mechanisms. _3 points_
   - We have a sign ordinance but actions are not subject to design review. _2 points_
   - We intend to establish a sign ordinance in the near future. _1 point_

   **Comments:**

12. Does your community have requirements and incentives such as a streamlined permitting process, fee waivers, density bonuses and/or other incentives to encourage redevelopment, infill, and adaptive reuse of underutilized and vacant sites and buildings?
   - We offer a number of incentives to encourage redevelopment of underutilized or vacant sites and buildings and infill development; and we have reclamation requirements for big box development. _3 points_
   - We have a couple of these or similar incentives. _2 points_
   - We are developing a process to incentivize development of underutilized and vacant sites. _1 point_

   **Comments:**
Clean water, clean air and natural open land are essential elements of public health and quality of life for Arizona residents, visitors and future generations. Restoring and protecting natural assets and open space and promoting energy efficiency and green building should be incorporated into all land use and infrastructure planning decisions.

All Communities (small, medium and large)

13. Has your community identified its natural assets (rivers, mountains, mesas, open space, wildlife corridors, views) and taken steps to restore or protect them?
   • We identify our natural assets in our general/comprehensive plan and have taken steps to protect/restore them through water, wastewater and conservation easement programs; wildlife corridor planning; incorporating recommendations from Arizona Game and Fish Department’s Wildlife Friendly Guidelines; etc. _ 3 points
   • We have identified our natural assets in our general/comprehensive plan and are developing policies and/or programs to begin the process of protecting them. _ 2 points
   • We have identified natural assets. _ 1 point

Comments:

14. Does your community have programs to acquire and maintain open space?
   • We have regulatory mechanisms and resources to acquire and maintain open space. _ 3 points
   • We have policies that address acquiring and maintaining open space. _ 2 points
   • We are developing programs and policies for the acquisition and maintenance of open space. _ 1 point

Comments:

“One generation plants the trees; another gets the shade”  – Chinese proverb
In the last decade, Arizona has experienced catastrophic wildfires in our forests, grasslands, deserts and river areas. It is important for every community to have a mitigation plan in place to minimize susceptibility to wildfires.

**Resources for creating wildfire or urban fires mitigation plans**

Consider becoming a certified Firewise Community. The program includes:
- Wildland fire staff from federal, state and local agencies provide a community with information about coexisting with wildfire along with mitigation information tailored to that specific area
- The community assesses its risk and creates its own network of cooperating homeowners, agencies and organizations
- The community identifies and implements local solutions

Following the Healthy Forests Restoration Act (HFRA) in 2003, additional guidance is available in preparing a Community Wildfire Protection Plan. HFRA created the first statutory incentives for the US Forest Service and Bureau of Land Management to give consideration to the priorities of local communities as they develop and implement forest management and hazardous fuel reduction projects. There is considerable flexibility for communities to determine the substance and detail of their plans.

15. How does your community plan to minimize its susceptibility to wildfires?
   - We have a plan and/or ordinance that identifies defensible space / buffer zones that includes a process for reduction of hazardous fuels. _ 3 points
   - We are developing a wildfire defense plan and have already established a process for reduction of hazardous fuels. _ 2 points
   - We are considering the possible adoption of a wildfire defense plan and/or process for reduction of hazardous fuels. _ 1 point

   **Comments:**

16. Do local regulations require open space within new development?
   - New developments must contribute additional open space and should provide connections to adjacent open spaces (either existing or planned, such as a planned park or recreation trail). _ 3 points
   - New developments are encouraged to provide open spaces with access to them, but our regulations do not provide guidelines for the type and location. _ 2 points
   - We are developing requirements for open space within new developments. _ 1 point

   **Comments:**

17. Do you have a comprehensive water resource management plan(s) in place?
   - Our community has a comprehensive water resource management plan, and a drought and conservation plan that is enforceable by ordinance; and we have an adequate and assured water supply for 100 years or more. _ 3 points
   - We have a water resource management plan in place; and have an adequate and assured water supply for 100 years or more. _ 2 points
   - We are developing a plan for future water needs. _ 1 point

   **Comments:**

Additional information on water resource management plans is available from the Arizona Department of Water Resources (ADWR) at www.azwater.gov.

Colorado River near Yuma; Schnebly Hill in Sedona
Courtesy of the Arizona Department of Commerce
18. Does your community’s general/comprehensive plan have a natural open space element that strives for a regional integrated system that includes protected land critical for preserving wildlife habitat connectivity?

- We emphasize conservation of wildlife habitat and corridors in our general/comprehensive plan; strive for a regionally integrated system of open space that includes habitat that we are taking steps to conserve.  
  _ 3 points

- We emphasize the importance of our wildlife habitat and corridors in our general/comprehensive plan but we have not taken any steps to restore or protect them.  
  _ 2 points

- We are considering how to incorporate the importance of wildlife habitat and corridors into our planning process.  
  _ 1 point

Comments:

19. How does your community encourage actions that mitigate negative impacts to wildlife habitat from development?

- We have an environmental planning element in our general/comprehensive plan that contains policies to mitigate quantifiable habitat loss for new development and redevelopment; development guidelines that require mitigation; and we encourage developers to use techniques, such as mitigation banking.  
  _ 3 points

- Our development guidelines require mitigation for crucial habitats.  
  _ 2 points

- We are developing policies and guidelines to mitigate negative impacts to wildlife habitat.  
  _ 1 point

Comments:

Large Communities

20. Does your community protect open space, manage growth and infrastructure and encourage economic development through programs like cluster development, transfer of development rights (TDR), conservation easements, and partnering with land trusts?

- We utilize more than one of these or similar programs.  
  _ 3 points

- We utilize one of these or similar programs.  
  _ 2 points

- We are in the process of developing programs to protect open space and focus growth.  
  _ 1 point
21. Does your general/comprehensive plan include provisions to reduce adverse air quality impacts?
   • Our plan addresses air quality and proposes ways to reduce adverse air quality conditions. We have (or collaborate with the responsible party) policies, regulations and funding to implement these proposals. _ 3 points
   • Our plan has air quality policies but we do not have regulations or funding to implement air quality improvements. _ 2 points
   • We are (or collaborating with the responsible party) developing policies, regulations and funding to promote air quality. _ 1 point

Comments:

22. Does your community have an energy efficiency plan?
   • We have an adopted community-wide energy efficiency plan that identifies policies and incentives to promote greater use of renewable energy such as geothermal, solar, wind and biomass. _ 3 points
   • Alternative energy sources are addressed in the energy element of our general/comprehensive plan. _ 2 points
   • We are considering the adoption of an energy efficiency plan and/or energy element to our general/comprehensive plan that includes alternative sources of energy. _ 1 point

Comments:

23. Does your community require and/or provide incentives for green building?
   • We have incentives for new commercial and residential development, including multifamily, and require new public facilities to build to Leadership in Energy and Environmental Design (LEED) standards, Energy Star standards, 2006 International Energy Conservation Code standards plus 15% more energy efficient, or another equivalent industry recognized green building standard or our own if it is equivalent to or surpasses industry recognized standards. _ 3 points
   • We offer incentives to new commercial and residential development, including multifamily, and public facilities to build to our community’s green building or industry recognized standards. _ 2 points
   • We are considering offering incentives for new green building. _ 1 point

Comments:
Future planning and development should assure the availability of a range of choices in housing and affordability, employment, education, transportation and other essential services to encourage a jobs/housing balance and vibrant community-based workforce.

“Prepare today for the needs of tomorrow.”
–Aesop

Municipalities with a population greater than 50,000 must have a housing element in their general plan (A.R.S §9-461.05) that includes:
• standards and programs to eliminate substandard dwelling conditions
• improved housing quality
• variety and affordability
• identification and analysis of existing and forecasted housing needs

This element must make equal provision for the housing needs of all segments of the community regardless of race, color, creed or economic level.

All Communities (small, medium and large)

24. Does your general/comprehensive plan address the following housing issues: elimination of substandard dwelling conditions, the improvement of housing quality, variety and affordability, provision of adequate sites for housing and identification and analysis of existing and forecasted housing needs?

• Our general/comprehensive plan has a housing element and/or we have a specific housing plan that addresses all of the housing issues listed above. _ 3 points

• Our general/comprehensive plan includes policies that address more than one of the housing issues listed above._ 2 points

• Our general/comprehensive plan addresses one of the listed housing issues._ 1 point

Comments:
SECTION IV: OPPORTUNITY FOR BROAD CHOICES

25. Does your community track the balance of jobs, wages and housing to inform land use decisions?
   - We regularly analyze the interrelatedness and balance of jobs, wages and housing; and have policies and regulations in place to encourage balance. _ 3 points
   - We link housing and economic development efforts, but have not specifically developed policies, regulations or procedures to encourage or track the jobs/housing balance. _ 2 points
   - We are studying how to link housing, economic development and employment information. _ 1 point

   Comments:

26. Which option best describes the mix of housing types approved in your community?
   - We approve a wide mix of housing types including single-family homes, multi-family housing, and senior housing that reflects the composition of our community and addresses a broad spectrum of needs. _ 3 points
   - We approve a limited mix, including some affordable housing. _ 2 points
   - We have plans to increase diversity in housing and affordable housing. _ 1 point

   Comments:

27. Does your community include in its planning process the reservation of school sites in locations that foster safe learning environments for students, such as within walking distance from home and safely away from major transportation corridors?
   - We require that future school sites be located within neighborhoods, whenever feasible, and ensure safe and direct routes for students to walk or bike to school from their homes. _ 3 points
   - We coordinate with the local school board about the feasibility of requiring school sites to be located within direct walking distances from the neighborhoods they serve, preferably away from (or buffered from) major transportation corridors. _ 2 points
   - Our school siting criteria deal only with proximities to certain business types (e.g. bars, etc.). _ 1 point

   Comments:

Techniques that directly and indirectly support a jobs/housing balance:
- Provide for mixed land uses
- Revise the zoning map to bring jobs closer to neighborhoods (reduce the separation of land uses)
- Require or encourage planned unit developments (PUD) to provide a mix of residences and employment
- Develop home occupation regulations
- Permit accessory units (garage apartments) and live/work units
- Offer incentives such as density bonuses, reduced fees, streamline permit process and impact fee waivers.

American Planning Association PAS Report 516

Mix and affordability of housing includes the availability of:
- **Homeownership Opportunities**
  market rate: 120% area median income (AMI) or more; and entry level homeownership: 50-80% AMI and 80-120% AMI
- **Rental Opportunities**
  market rate; subsidized; special needs including supportive housing for people with disabilities or chronic health problems or senior housing
- **Other**
  subsidized housing projects; Section 8/Choice Voucher; supportive housing; senior; public housing

AZ Smart Growth Scorecard Page 18
28. Does your community have pedestrian mobility options that include an integrated system for bicycling and walking linking residential, commercial, and recreation areas?

- We have bike lanes, trails and pedestrian areas that are interconnected with design features, such as landscaping, sidewalks, trees, shade, lighting, and benches.  
  _ 3 points
- We have trails and bike lanes but not a connected system.  
  _ 2 points
- We are in the process of creating pedestrian and bicycle connections.  
  _ 1 point

Comments:

Medium and Large Communities

29. Can community residents meet most daily shopping needs – food, hardware, banking and clothing – locally?

- Everyday needs can be met through a diversity of local businesses.  
  _ 3 points
- Most everyday needs can be met locally but occasionally residents travel outside the area for their needs.  
  _ 2 points
- Residents have to travel outside the area for most everyday needs, but some staples can be found locally.  
  _ 1 point

Comments:

30. Does your community provide incentives to support affordable housing?

- We promote a wide range of incentives for more affordable housing production.  
  _ 3 points
- We offer some incentives but they are not often utilized.  
  _ 2 points
- We are developing affordable housing incentives.  
  _ 1 point

Comments:

Incentives to support affordable housing include:

- density bonuses, fee waivers and fast track permitting
- higher density zones or zones that allow a mix of housing options
- apartments and accessory units with single-family homes
- affordable homes alongside market-rate housing
- flexible housing sizes (for example, allowing for smaller units versus establishing large minimum floor areas for all housing units)
- manufactured housing allowed by-right
- low minimum lot sizes
- policies/initiatives that encourage supportive housing for people with disabilities.

The U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD) definition of “affordable” is the generally accepted definition: housing that costs no more than 30% of a household’s monthly income, including rent/mortgage and other expenses, such as utilities.
The Arizona Department of Housing publishes an annual report, *Arizona's Housing Market… A Glance* that provides information on trends and affordability. The “stop-light charts” in the appendices give examples of what professions can afford to live in different communities throughout the state.

**SECTION IV: OPPORTUNITY FOR BROAD CHOICES**

31. Does your community plan for and track the mix and affordability of housing at the local or regional level?
   - We conduct (or collaborate at a regional level) housing studies every few years to assess affordable housing in our area, inventory the mix of our housing and consider this data in our plan updates. __3 points__
   - We track housing data (or collaborate at a regional level). __2 points__
   - We have information from previous studies, but limited information on our current housing market. __1 point__

Comments:

32. Does your zoning allow for mixed uses, especially in designated growth areas or corridors?
   - Our zoning ordinance allows mixed land uses in a number of locations throughout the community and in designated growth areas. __3 points__
   - Mixed land uses are allowed, but in limited zones. __2 points__
   - We are developing provisions in our zoning code that allow mixed uses. __1 point__

Comments:

To gain a national perspective of housing affordability, the National Low Income Housing Coalition compiles *Out of Reach*, a report that offers a side-by-side comparison of wages and rents in every county, metropolitan statistical area, combined nonmetropolitan area, and state.

**Working Families Struggle to Afford Basics**

This graph represents monthly expenses for a married couple with two children - a 3 yr-old and a 7-year old. Each parent works full-time earning $8.66 an hour with an annual household income of approximately $36,000.

Many families face difficult financial decisions to make ends meet. In Maricopa County, 38% of families live on an annual income of $35,000 or less. Above is a graph representing how these working families typically spread their incomes to cover monthly household expenses.
Meeting each community’s long-range needs for public utility, health, communications and transportation infrastructure in a timely and fiscally responsible manner should be an essential objective of local and regional plans and implementation efforts. Communities should strive to offer a wider range of transportation options— from walking and biking to transit and automobiles—to increase people’s access to jobs, goods, services and recreation. Communities should also plan for development of its public health, social service, and natural infrastructure including hospitals, emergency facilities, and wildlife corridors.

All Communities (small, medium and large)

33. Does your community encourage new development to locate where infrastructure and services already exist?
   • We have adopted a Capital Improvement Program (CIP) that is linked to our general/comprehensive plan, and have an agreement or master plan with nearby jurisdictions linking existing and future infrastructure. We also require that each new development be responsible for its proportional cost of the impact it has on specific facilities affected by the new development.  
   • We have a CIP linked to our general/comprehensive plan and are discussing adopting agreements with nearby jurisdictions to have a long-term plan for coordinated infrastructure. 
   • We have an adopted Capital Improvement Program (CIP) that is linked to our general/comprehensive plan.

Comments:

“The problems that exist in the world today cannot be solved by the level of thinking that created them.”

—Albert Einstein
34. How does your community plan for its future social infrastructure and service needs, such as child and dependant care, senior services, disability services, food assistance, shelters, etc.?

- Our general/comprehensive plan and zoning ordinance address these needs to accommodate future service infrastructure. _3 points
- We have some policies in our general/comprehensive plan regarding our social infrastructure and service needs. _2 points
- Our community has engaged government and nonprofit social service providers, community organizations and faith-based groups in community planning issues. _1 point

Comments:

35. How does your community plan and coordinate the development of public utilities, including power, water, and sewer?

- We plan and coordinate with local utilities and the Arizona Corporation Commission (ACC), when possible. _3 points
- We plan for public utilities but lack coordination. _2 points
- We are developing a process to coordinate and effectively address public utilities. _1 point

Comments:

Medium and Large Communities

36. Does your community track (or collaborate at the regional level) travel patterns to better understand how and why people travel in your area?

- We conduct (or collaborate at a regional level) traffic pattern studies every few years and review the need and efficiency of programs that are impacted by the study (such as ride-share, HOV lanes and regularly scheduled public transit). _3 points
- We conduct (or collaborate at a regional and/or state level) traffic pattern studies but don't link them to multi-modal transportation programs. _2 points
- We are developing plans to track travel patterns. _1 point

Comments:
37. How does your community or region address airport planning?

- Airport planning is part of our regional land use and transportation planning process that includes access, land use compatibility, and noise mitigation. _ 3 points
- The airport authority has responsibility for airport planning and we closely coordinate with them. _ 2 points
- We are developing a process to incorporate airport planning with regional land use decisions. _ 1 point

Comments:

38. Does your community’s general/comprehensive plan address access to or construction of hospitals, healthcare clinics, pharmacies, and location of emergency and social service facilities?

- Our general/comprehensive plan addresses access and siting of hospitals, healthcare and emergency and social service facilities, such as police and fire, and considers mobility options for residents. _ 3 points
- We consider access and location when planning for future hospitals, healthcare, pharmacies and emergency and social service facilities. _ 2 points
- We are developing a process to better plan for hospitals, healthcare clinics, pharmacies and emergency and social service facilities. _ 1 point

Comments:

39. How does your community integrate wildlife movement corridors (connecting larger blocks of wildlife habitat) to ensure motorist safety and provide safe wildlife passage?

- We identify important wildlife crossing sites in our environmental planning, open space, and/or transportation elements of our general/comprehensive plan and we incorporate open space and wildlife passage structures along existing and future roadways and infrastructure, when possible. _ 3 points
- We have identified important wildlife crossing sites but lack specific general/comprehensive plan policies. _ 2 points
- We are considering ways to reduce vehicular collisions with wildlife. _ 1 point

Comments:
Transit-Oriented Development (TOD) is a growing trend in urban planning that focuses on the creation of compact, walkable communities centered around high quality transit systems with the following goals:

- Connect major activity centers
- Create economic development
- Support population and employment growth
- Improve transit service
- Mitigate parking constraints

_Tucson Department of Transportation_

40. Does your community have a transit program?
   - Our transit program includes ride-share, HOV lanes and regularly scheduled public transit, such as bus and trolley, or similar programs. ___ 3 points
   - Our transit program has regularly scheduled public transit. ___ 2 points
   - We are developing a transit program. ___ 1 point

Comments:

Large Communities

41. Does your community have incentives and flexible regulations to promote Transit Oriented Development (TOD)?
   - Regulations for development near transit facilities allow a wide range of options, including increased density, a mix of land uses, flexible parking requirements, connections to multi-modal transportation; and offer incentives for affordable housing near transit facilities. ___ 3 points
   - Our regulations have some variation and flexibility to promote TOD. ___ 2 points
   - We are developing incentives to promote TOD. ___ 1 point

Comments:
A broad spectrum of business and resources that support existing businesses as well as attracting new ones should be promoted to strengthen diverse economic development. Future planning should balance the availability of national retailers, businesses and employers while encouraging entrepreneurship and locally owned businesses. Communities should consider tools, both financial and regulatory, that are needed to facilitate reserving land designated for future employment sites and corridors.

By including an economic development element in a general or comprehensive plan, a community is creating the foundation to ensure that land use, infrastructure, and economic development goals are mutually supportive. Arizona statutes do not require economic development elements, however, they provide an important framework for a community to determine its economic development goals and establish policies for economic diversity and sustainability, available land for development and job centers, zoning for industrial or commercial uses, the provision of infrastructure, broadband and communications connectivity, workforce development, the protection of agriculture and farmland, small business development, and much more.
Coconino YouthBuild provides job training and educational opportunities for disadvantaged youth. Over a two year period, students ages 17-24 will receive education and job training while constructing or repairing housing for low income families in their own neighborhood. Participants will split their time between the construction site and the classroom, where they will earn their GED or high school diploma or an Alternative Energy Technical Certificate from the Community College.

44. Has your community created specific training and workforce development programs to meet the needs of current and emerging industries?

- Our community works closely with our one-stop career center(s) and/or education providers to create industry tailored training programs that meet the needs of our community and local industries. _ 3 points
- We work with our one-stop career center(s) and/or education providers but have not created any industry specific training. _ 2 points
- We are developing plans to work with the one-stop center(s) and/or education providers. _ 1 point

Comments:

45. Does your community support entrepreneurs and start-up businesses?

- We have information to direct people to educational organizations which provide one-on-one assistance and workshops on how to start and operate a business. _ 3 points
- We collaborate with nearby communities where small business services are located to provide information to our community residents. _ 2 points
- We assist start-up businesses when contacted. _ 1 point

Comments:

46. How does your community support existing businesses?

- We have an active business retention and expansion program that includes an action plan to meet with targeted business owners and conduct annual surveys. _ 3 points
- We have a business retention and expansion program that identifies and assists high risk businesses. _ 2 points
- We assist existing business owners when contacted. _ 1 point

Comments:
To attract businesses, a community must establish itself as a desirable place to relocate. A community can develop the following:

- an attraction campaign promoting their area as an environment where business thrives
- stressing a positive and business friendly image
- quality of life
- skilled workforce
- financial competitiveness
- labor availability
- skill levels
- site and land availability
- transportation access
- sound infrastructure.

National Council for Urban Environmental Development

47. Do you have an active business attraction program? __ 3 points

- We have developed a marketing plan with goals and objectives to identify potential businesses that fit the strengths of the community and region; have performed effective targeted marketing strategies to those businesses (such as industry newsletters and fairs, magazines, direct mailings and email); ensure the community website provides information crucial to site selectors; and we have an established process to meet and greet site selectors.
- We have a website with information to attract new businesses and an established process to meet and greet site selectors.
- We assist relocating businesses when contacted. __ 1 point

Comments:

Medium and Large Communities

48. How does your community attract higher wage jobs while also addressing low and middle-skilled worker advancement? __ 3 points

- Our business attraction and expansion efforts recruit jobs that offer employment opportunities for all skill levels, pay wages above the average median income in Arizona and provide employee benefits, including skill development and advancement.
- We recruit businesses and industries for multiple skill levels that pay wages above the average median income in Arizona.
- We are working to attract jobs that provide opportunities for multiple skill levels. __ 1 point

Comments:

Wages and Affordability

Planning discussions must include strategies to increase economic mobility opportunities. Many communities are not truly “affordable” for current and future residents. Workers should be able to afford to live near their workplace.

Economic development strategies should focus on employment opportunities for the low and middle-skilled workforce, as well as focusing on economic development efforts that attract higher-end jobs and workers with opportunities for skill development and career advancement (including workforce supports such as access to affordable child care and quality benefits packages).

49. Does your community regularly track (or work with an entity that tracks) local and regional economic information and trends? __ 3 points

- We have regular reports on local and regional economic information that includes data on sources of income, job creation, wages and housing affordability.
- We have regular reports on local and regional economic information, but the information is limited.
- We have a profile of our community but do not regularly track local and regional economic information and trends. __ 1 point

Comments:
There has been enormous growth in advanced communications technologies in recent years. According to the Federal Communications Commission (FCC), the number of total broadband subscribers reached approximately 38 million at the end of 2004, representing a 34% increase from 2003, and a 440% increase from 2000.

50. Does your community have communication/broadband services or plans to acquire them?
   • We have broadband or a plan in place for how to acquire it that includes diverse community involvement (i.e. local businesses, emergency responders, community colleges, school districts, libraries, etc). _ 3 points
   • We are developing broadband access or have identified steps to provide these services. _ 2 points
   • We are thinking about developing a plan for broadband access and have discussed it with our elected officials. _ 1 point

Comments:

With private partners, the Arizona Government Information Technology Agency (GITA) is conducting a Broadband Assessment Study to determine the feasibility, necessary resources, expected outcomes and implementation recommendations for the development of a Broadband Assessment Project. The Study also identifies the methods to estimate the location and current supply and demand for broadband service throughout the state. The goal of this study is to identify broadband deficits in rural Arizona.

The FCC can provide additional information on broadband and its role in driving economic growth. Smaller rural communities can also gain assistance from USDA Rural Development.