

# **CITIZEN'S TRANSPORTATION OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE**

## **Arizona Department of Transportation**

### **Draft Minutes**

### **January 26, 2010**

A Citizen's Transportation Oversight Committee (CTOC) meeting was held at the Arizona Department of Transportation, 206 South 17<sup>th</sup> Avenue, Phoenix, Arizona 85007 on January 26, 2010, with Chairman Roc Arnett presiding.

#### **Members Present:**

Roc Arnett, Chairman  
Kyle Robinson, Maricopa County District 1  
Nelson Ladd, Maricopa County District 3  
Leyton Woolf, Maricopa County District 4  
Peggy Jones, Maricopa County District 5

#### **Members Absent:**

None

#### **Others Present:**

Mike Taylor, Valley Metro	Bill Cowdrey, HDR Engineering
Stephanie Wilson, McDOT	Randi Brook, Citizen
Elizabeth Neville, RFS	Kwi Kang, RFS
William "Blue" Crowley, Citizen	Paul Hodgins, RPTA
Sintra Hoffman, CCP	Steve Hull, CTOC Special Assistant
Adrienne Weinkamer, A.G. Office	Dianne Barker, Citizen
John Fink, ADOT	Don Mauller, ADOT
Don Dassinger, ADOT	

#### **1. Call to Order:**

Chairman Arnett Called to Order the Citizen's Transportation Oversight Committee meeting at 4:00 p.m.

#### **2. Pledge of Allegiance:**

The Chair led the CTOC Members and the public in the Pledge of Allegiance.

#### **3. Welcome and Opening Comments:**

The Chair welcomed the public, public officials, members of CTOC and staff to the meeting.

#### **4. Call to the Public:**

The Chair read CTOC's Call to the Public policy. He then called the first citizen to speak.

Blue Crowley, citizen, stated that he would like to point out on the RPTA we are not going to be able to discuss anything with them because it is not an action item. I have the new bus book here and like the last one, it says you can buy the transit tickets at the transit centers. In Peggy's and Leyton's Districts, that's Arrowhead Mall and Desert Sky Mall, neither of which has dispensers for the tickets. Now, we can get them at any of the Light Rail stops, in fact on the agenda for the Board of Directors for the RPTA, they have under action items, the contract award for 24 of those dispensers to be placed along the extended Light Rail route. Isn't it nice if you are on the rail you can get it but if you aren't on the rail, you can't. I also called Paul before this meeting and asked if he would please bring the documentation on how much a fare box recovery we are getting being when they did the rate hike they were only missing it by one tenth of a percent. With the rate hike, instead of it being four percent which would have covered ten cents to do it, they raised it one dollar which is a forty percent increase. If you buy it on the bus, it's \$5.25 which is 120 percent increase. I know that fare box is bringing in more than their 25 percent that they are supposed to be getting in. Why are they cutting back service? I note they have not cut back any RPTA or City of Phoenix staff. They have not cut back on any of the Park-and-Rides and they haven't cut back on things like the people mover which instead of them putting the rail through the airport which they should have done since we have a terminal underneath terminal four, they are going to spend \$2 billion on a people mover because they said with the rail going through the airport it would slow it down too much. This isn't the first white elephant they created. We have a transit center underneath the deck park tunnel which they got the money for in 1986. When are they going to use that? It's part of the equation that isn't being addressed. I also asked MAG to give me some documentation to show that the east valley, because of Roc's and other peoples abilities, is scheduled to get some of the bus routing permits now and within the next five years but Peggy and Leyton on the west side, we don't get those until things like 75<sup>th</sup> Avenue and 83<sup>rd</sup> to get a bus until 2025. That's totally what it shouldn't be. It needs to be done to the level it's projected to do. I would like to point out that in the minutes; you are not getting it down correctly. Also, I still don't have a computer Steve so when I ask to get the agenda mailed, I'm serious on it and none of you picked up on that to instruct him to do so. I was able to use someone's computer and it still took 20 minutes to get to the CTOC agenda. It's not an easy thing to do even if you have the equipment to do it. So, you are very proud that you have saved \$1,800 in stamps; I still need you to spend .42 cents on one and send me the agenda because living out here in the middle of the desert in Wittmann, I am 20 miles in both directions from a library as you suggested go to the library to do it. I need you to send that information so that I am aware of these things.

The Chair responded that we will follow up on the fare box return, and that there are answers to the Deck Park Tunnel and People Mover.

Dianne Barker, citizen, stated she came from an innovative workshop at the City of Phoenix Council. They are meeting to look at service, revenues, public-private partnerships and their organization to innovate during the recession. At MAG, they are half of the voting block; I would think that what happens there is paramount here for the oversight to transportation. In regard to signage, Mr. McKnight, who has been ill apparently felt well enough to drive his automobile and he said that ADOT needs to do better in signage and it will help out on congestion particularly with lost people here this season that come in from other areas. There needs to be some oversight at ADOT for when they put construction signs up because he said east bound on McDowell at 16<sup>th</sup>, he ends up in Tempe when he is trying to get to 28<sup>th</sup> and Thomas because the signs started to send him on the 202 west and so he ended up on the 143. Bob was born here; he knows the area. When I talked to Mr. Hernandez, he said ADOT has a MUTCD – Manual Uniform Traffic Control and Devices and they are supposed to make all the signs in compliance with highway maintenance. You can send a directive that way. Bob even said you don't need to route by the signs through Deck Park. Deck Park doesn't need anymore transportation. The suggestion is for this community to have an elevated rail and go around the Broadway curve through Deck Park and up Grand Avenue in which more and more people are supportive. We need to deal with what we have affordably and get the traffic moving. When people are lost they get stressed and they have accidents. I'm hoping you will do something about it. I'm interested in what RPTA says. I differ from what Blue says that we can't enter into some type of discussion at your will. They adopted MAG's and I've been able to speak on every agenda item either Call to the Public or maybe if we have a question I'd like to enter. I don't want to take the time unnecessarily. I did call. I do read your stuff. I'm interested. I read the minutes and my thing they must have misinterpreted what I

said the last time that I need the cars around the capitol, no, I said I beat the cars. It's getting embarrassing for my girlfriends; I beat them on my bicycle. I was at a rally the other day and we all went for coffee and I'm there five minutes before the rest of them. There is something that is going on that needs to be looked at. And I hope that everybody comes to the MAG meeting tomorrow. It's at 5:00 p.m.

**6. Recognition of Departing Member:**

The Chair recognized and thanked member Leyton Woolf for his faithful and dedicated service over the past three years serving the citizens of Maricopa County. A Plaque of Appreciation signed by the Governor Janice Brewer was presented to him.

The Chair stated that with his term ending on March 21, 2010, this was the last regular meeting as a member of CTOC.

**7. CTOC Public Comment Forms:**

The Chair reported that CTOC's Call to the Public and Speaking Forms have been reviewed and their uses approved. Modest changes were made and formal approval was sought.

Steve Hull, Special Assist. to CTOC commented that the modest corrections on the forms are just in phrasing and they do not change how we are handling the Call to the Public. It's still the MAG style of blue forms and yellow forms.

A question was asked by a Committee member.

In reply regarding consent items, it was explained that CTOC does not have a consent agenda.

Board Action: Nelson Ladd, Member moved to approve the revised Call to the Public and Speaking Forms. The motion was seconded by Leyton Woolf, Member and carried unanimously.

**5. Review and approval of the November 24, 2009, meeting minutes:**

The Chair called for a motion to approve the minutes of the November 24, 2009, meeting.

A correction was made to the minutes. Rather than stating that Ms. Barker, citizen "needs a car at the capitol," it now reads that Ms. Barker beats the cars driving to the capitol.

Mr. Crowley, citizen asked that the spelling of Wittmann be corrected in the minutes.

Another correction in what I said, is that the MAG program shows they want the rail to go to Black Canyon City and what I was trying to point out is that we needed to go to Wickenburg and in the MAG study they state that only 50 people between Wittmann would be going and using the rail if it ran between Wittmann and Wickenburg. And my statement is that the Board of Supervisors has already agreed to the plat that has 20,000 homes going in there and I stated with an average house size being four individuals that is 80,000 so in the simple math if we have 80,000 people out there I think that more than 50 of them would be using the rail if you used it to the full extent and those railroad lines already run there. When you look at the railroad trains that run on the rail already, the way they operate is with an electrical engine on each one of the engine's wheels to pull it down the road. If it were cheaper to run it electrically with the overhead wire they would have done that a long time ago because we are wasting electricity with the overhead wires on our light rail project. I'm trying to say that one, it needed to have more solar to it so we would be producing electricity not just using and we don't need to be wasting electricity with the overhead wires, what we need to do is have the engines going to each one of those wheels but with Marty Shultz being on that Governor's Committee as Chair and a Vice President of Pinnacle West, why would APS want that done; what they want

is to get the most electricity used as possible. And as to the form revisions, being that Steven didn't send me anything, I don't know what they are and I would like to have them explained if possible.

Board Action: Corrections were noted. Mr. Woolf moved to approve the amended November 24, 2009, minutes. The motion was seconded by Mr. Ladd and carried unanimously.

**8. ADOT Budget Update:**

John Fink, ADOT Assistant Director, Finance and Accounting, presented how revenue declines and budget cuts are impacting ADOT operations and funding for the Regional Transportation Plan Freeway Program. PowerPoint slides were presented and included Highway User Revenue Fund Percentage Changes by Fiscal Year from FY 2001 – 2010. Beginning in 2008, Highway User Revenues were down. The Regional Area Road Fund Percentage Change by Fiscal Year FY 2001-2010 shows the same trends. For the first seven years, there was positive revenue growth. A series of slides looked at various components of the Highway User Revenue Fund and Regional Area Road Fund. They show a 12 month rolling total collections. Gasoline tax is the largest component of Highway User Revenue Fund revenue. We have returned to levels seen in March 2004. There is some stabilization in gas tax revenue. Retail Sales Revenue is the largest component of the Regional Area Road Fund. They are currently at the July 2004 levels. Declines have slowed down and we are beginning to see some stabilization in Retail Sales Revenue. Contracting has returned to 1999 levels with no signs of stabilization. The State General Fund Structural Deficit graph shows a continued growth in the budget deficit. Additional slides included Transfer to DPS from HURF and State Highway Fund and VLT Transfers to DPS and State General Fund. The Low Cash Balance of the State Highway Fund has been negative since February 2008 and continues to worsen each month. Projections for both the Highway User Revenue Fund and Maricopa County Regional Area Road Fund were shared. Appropriated and Executed Budgets were explained along with the need to cut expenditures through a variety of measures including a hiring freeze, cutting expenses, furloughs, and other actions.

Questions Asked:

The Chair asked about the bottom line in reduction in projects and staff. Mr. Fink said this situation has impacts depending on the region in the state. In Maricopa County, a dedicated source of revenue, the half-cent sales tax, allows us to continue the construction program albeit at a lower level. The statewide program has a more dramatic impact because we do not have other funding sources available.

**9. RPTA Valley Metro Budget Update:**

Paul Hodgins, RPTA Valley Metro, Capital Programming Manager, presented a Regional Transit Funding Update. Funding for transit is generated from many sources including the County Transportation Excise Tax, local sales tax, local general funds, fares, federal support and state support. A performance report is presented each year. The FY 2009 Operating Budget was shared for the fixed route bus, Light Rail and para-transit which is the Dial-A-Ride System. Trends in revenue sources show local tax sources for transit are declining, state support is declining and federal support is stable. There is concern that state support funds may be needed to help balance the state budget. Graphs were shared showing a decline in taxes dedicated to transit. Impacts include service impacts, fare increases, capital project deferrals, reduction in customer service and reduction in other regional services such as security.

Questions Asked:

The Chair asked about different entities included in numbers reported and asked if there would be a savings if the systems were combined into one.

In replied Mr. Hodgins stated there is potential. Several things are being reviewed and there is a strategic plan to regionalize some of the functions.

The Chair asked about the potential savings.

Mr. Hodgins stated, those numbers have not been looked at yet. The Board adopted a strategic plan that moves toward regionalization. It is believed that there will be savings by bringing these systems together. The Chair asked for additional information regarding savings potential.

Mr. Crowley, citizen, commented that when Paul said the increases were 40 percent for the bus and 57 percent for the express that is if you buy the ticket other than on the bus. If you buy the ticket on the bus, you know how much the price rises, 120 percent. You didn't show that. Also, with that figure of 25 percent, I tried to get you to get for me how much we are bringing in with the fare box with that increase. You only missed it when you originally came to the public four or five tenths of a percent so that converted to a dime so when they are getting that 40 percent rather than 4 percent, that's ten times what you quote needed to get to that level and when you raise it 120 percent. Also on the rural routes, we don't have a fare box at Arrowhead or at Desert Sky so when we use that system we are discriminated against to that 125 percent. The closest place to Arrowhead to get a bus ticket is 67<sup>th</sup> and Bell. Thank you for your time.

Mr. Hodgins responded that there is a plan to provide fare vending machines at transit centers and other locations. The contract with the provider met the compliance for security. Since that time, the compliance has changed, becoming stricter. At this time the machines do not meet the compliance. Although the City of Phoenix has authorization to purchase more fare vending machines to install in transit centers and we asked our board for authorization to purchase fare vending machines to install along the lines, we will not do that. Phoenix will not do that until they become compliant and are secure as possible for credit card transactions. There is a plan but it will take time to fix that software. It is hoped to be resolved by July.

Ms. Barker, citizen, stated as a citizen of Maricopa County, I am interested in regionalism and the integration of our transportation all modes. I help people, encourage them and educate them in how to get out of the house in wheel chairs and I'm finding they like the regular service of the bus. There are highly trained bus drivers. The buses are \$4 or \$5 a mile where as Dial-A-Ride is \$39 a mile. The expense of the Dial-A-Ride System and the inconvenience is such a drain on our system that we can have a good transportation system for a lot less by looking at how the City of Phoenix and Valley Metro can get good transportation, flexible, and using the bus.

Kyle Robinson, Member asked if it's possible to purchase fares in the mail or online?

Mr. Hodgins said yes, you can purchase off the web site.

The Chair asked that the information be obtained and reported back to the Committee.

#### **10. Proposed Tentative Five-Year Freeway Program:**

Steve Hull and Kwi Kang, ADOT presented the Proposed Tentative Five-Year Freeway Program for FY 2011-2015. Mr. Hull stated that revenue is down to about \$9.5 billion for the rest of the Prop 400 program. The remaining cost a year ago was about \$15 billion to finish the Prop 400 program. MAG identified strategies to close some of the gap between revenue and costs. As a result, there are significant changes in the long-range plan. And some changes in the five-year program are currently being adopted. MAG will evaluate their entire program in about 18 months. MAG and ADOT are working together on the five-year plan. Costs and schedules were adjusted for the first three years of the five-year plan, FY 2011-13. In FY 2014, MAG did not adopt a specific list of projects in order to address the need to rebalance the program. This year, FY 2014 projects are being added to the list. For 2014 and 2015, new projects and deferrals are being added from FY 2010-13. In 2011-13, many changes are a repackaging of corridors such as the I-10 corridor, the South Mountain corridor and the SR303L corridor. Additional program changes include updating costs, adjusting project schedules to fit MAG scenario to balance cost and revenue and adjusting project schedules to align with current status of work in progress. In 2011-13, the largest corridors will be L303, first phase of I-10 Broadway curve project and South Mountain. Mr. Kang provided a brief presentation on proposed FY 2014 and 2015 projects. Projects include the I-10 Corridor; I-17 Corridor; US60, Grand Avenue; SR 101L,

Agua Fria and Pima Corridors; SR202L, South Mountain Corridor; SR202L, Red Mountain and Santan Corridors and SR303L Corridor. System-wide items include maintenance, right-of-way advance acquisition, freeway management system projects and preliminary engineering. A Tentative Program Summary was shared indicating an aggressive program for a total of \$3.87 billion for FY 2011-2015.

Questions Asked:

The Chair asked if the general purpose lane can be added without much effort.

Mr. Kang stated that it can be done fairly quickly.

Peggy Jones, Member asked for a definition of a local express lane.

Mr. Kang stated that a local express lane runs parallel to the main freeway; it's similar to a frontage road but less complex. If traveling a shorter distance, you travel alongside without merging into the freeway.

Mr. Hull added that local lanes are for people going a shorter distance resulting in less traffic merging onto the freeway.

Mr. Ladd asked about the projected income on the \$3.87 billion tentative program.

In reply, Mr. Hull explained that a cash flow analysis is in progress and the tentative finding is there is enough cash flow.

Mr. Crowley, citizen wanted to present for the record, MAG's Lifecycle Program for 2010. An old document before the economy downturn, the 2007 RTP, on page 1-4, under the Citizens Transportation Oversight Committee, to clarify something that you had asked about before it says that ADOT designates a special assistant to provide support staff to CTOC and assist in coordinating among CTOC, ADOT, MAG and the RPTA and local jurisdictions so with your idea of blending in that it is already part of your purview according to a document from 2007 and hopefully it is something that will be addressed. I also note that with all the expenditures what it is as their purview, I will leave this with staff in case any of you want to get a copy and you can get in touch with Jason Stevens at MAG. It has the super grid and when dating starting at 2008 but going from 2010, Camelback, Alma School, Elliott, University, Dysart, Hayden, McClintock, 59<sup>th</sup> Avenue, Broadway, Ray, Tatum, 44<sup>th</sup> Street, McDowell, McKellips, Peoria, Van Buren, Bell, Waddell, Thunderbird, 99<sup>th</sup>, Buckeye, Dunlap, Olive, Indian School, Queen Creek, Thomas, Litchfield, 83<sup>rd</sup> and 75<sup>th</sup> which aren't scheduled to get online until 2003. I need you to do two things. One, when you are building these roads and we know we need a fuller footprint for them to acquire the right-of-way rather than having to go back as we are on the Broadway curve but I appreciate the chairman's efforts to make sure that is one thing being addressed. With your advice to all of these different entities, the Transportation Board is one of them, I would like you to be stronger in how you communicate to them. And with doing the whole footprint, one thing sensitive to me and Dianne Barker is the bike lanes. If you are not taking that as a part of it you are not getting the job done correctly. As part of the roadway system, what we have is the rest areas. The state has now eliminated them to the point.... I tried to discuss it with Mr. Fink and he said to get in touch with the engineer because a lot of them have structural problems because we did not build them green and we didn't build them to the point where the sewage is being necessitated to where it should be. But with the county and the municipalities in the areas, I would appreciate they would be allowed to take over this and as an advisory to the State Board, I would like this body to say we need to have those things because when it comes to between driving drunk and driving drowsy, it is dangerous to a higher extent to be driving drowsy; that is the reason those rest areas are there. Let's do these things correctly and do the full footprint and do better planning.

Ms. Barker, citizen. I don't think the state measures drowsiness but they do measure drunkenness. There is a corridor around Sky Harbor. I wanted to call your attention to the fact that if we're busy with the City of Phoenix asking the Federal government for a lot of money to go through with this Sky Tram, I happened to read the payout ordinances and the big numbers really hit me I see we have to contract January 20 with that operator at Sky Harbor on this Sky Tram but \$78 million makes it a third of a billion now...it's an at risk, meaning that the local jurisdictions have to be responsible for this before the Federal government is going to reimburse them, the stimulus or discretionary money. I want ADOT if you weren't aware of this going on

because you do have the corridor over there; you gave them the 153 road and maybe still have some things going on there. The big picture is I think they mentioned about these Park-and-Rides and all the money going for that. I would like to see the emphasis of our transit start looking at the people and the service that need the help. I think it's wrongful to cut down on education and the dissemination of the use of the transit because I'm out there all the time finding lost people either wanting a ride by transit or by car and they need the education and information. Let's not cut down on that.

**11. Staff Report:**

- Mr. Hull stated that a small correction was needed on the agenda because the item is listed for information and discussion only; however, specific topics were not identified; therefore, there cannot be discussion in order to comply with the Open Meeting Law.
- On the Five-Year Freeway Program for the MAG Region, there is an arterial street program involved in that construction. MAG will have the arterial street program ready for their public hearing in March 2010. There will be a transit component of the Five-Year Program in March as well. A handout was offered listing the proposed projects in 2011-2015.
- An auditor was hired last fall and work is in progress for a Financial Compliance Audit for FY 2007 and 2008. A copy will be available for review in a few weeks.
- The State Auditor does a Five-Year Performance Audit of the entire system and plan. That work will begin in March or April 2010.
- March 2nd is the deadline to get the ARRA funds obligated. Congress has taken up a second round of stimulus funding called the Jobs Bill. This amount of money is similar to the first stimulus package but the schedule is tighter. All of the money has to be spent in 12 months and half of the funds have to be under contract within 90 days. For the MAG area, two projects are anticipated that will be design-build, taking some pieces out of the Five-Year Proposed Program and construct an HOV lane on SR 101 from I-10 to Tatum Boulevard which would complete the entire route. The other project would be HOV lanes from Gilbert Road to I-10 on Santan. Those two projects together would cost about \$280 million. \$130 million would be Regional Highway stimulus money. Another \$105 million would be the MAG portion of the local ARRA money. This is all proposed as the Jobs Bill has not been passed yet.

Questions Asked:

Mr. Robinson asked about the local communities and potential money in the Jobs Bill if they have "shovel ready projects".

Legal Council reminded CTOC Members that this agenda item is not marked for discussion.

Mr. Hull clarified what he stated earlier. MAG and their Transportation Policy Committee said they would transfer all of that money to ADOT and ADOT will be willing in exchange to swap the money for regular Federal funds. That money won't be lost to local opportunity.

The Chair stated that MAG has worked hard with the valley mayors to make certain that all shovel ready projects are ready and moving forward. Things are moving forward appropriately.

**12. Recommendations for Future Agenda Items:**

The Chair entertained future agenda items. There were none suggested.

**13. Next Meeting:**

March 19, 2010, 12 noon:  
Maricopa Association of Governments  
Joint Public Hearing  
203 North First Avenue  
Phoenix, Arizona

The Chair stated that the next meeting is a MAG-STB-RPTA-CTOC Joint Public Hearing. The next regular CTOC meeting is scheduled for May 18, 2010.

**14. Adjournment:**

Board Action: Mr. Woolf motioned to adjourn. The motion was seconded by Mr. Ladd and carried unanimously.

The meeting adjourned.